OK as to form only

### TOWN OF AURORA Zoning Board of Appeals Request



Building Application # Building Permit #	Zoning Appeal Case No
TO THE ZONING BOARD OF APPEALS, TO	OWN OF AURORA, NEW YORK
INSPECTOR on APPLICATION NO	D OF APPEALS FROM THE DECISION OF THE BUILDING WHEREBY THE BUILDING INSPECTOR DID DENY
TO <u>Cardea Health</u> Name of Applicant	
OF 26 massissippi st. Ste 400	o Buffalo NY
(Street & Number) (Municipali  A PERMIT FOR USE  () A VARIANCE FROM ZONING ORDINANG () A TEMPORARY PERMIT OR EXTENSION	(State) ( ) A CERTIFICATE OF EXISTING USE ( ) A PERMIT FOR OCCUPANCY
1. LOCATION OF THE PROPERTY //96 SBL# /65.00 - /-28.1 ZONING	G DISTRICT A
2. PROVISION(S) OF THE ZONING ORDIN and paragraph of the Zoning Ordinance being a Table of District Regulation	NANCE APPEALED. (Indicate the Article, section, sub-section, appealed, by number. Do not quote the Ordinance)
3. TYPE OF APPEAL. Appeal is made herew. () An interpretation () A variance () An exception () A temporar	ith for: - to the Zoning Ordinance
4. A PREVIOUS APPEAL () has () has not lor with respect to this property	been made with respect to this decision of the Building Inspector
NAMES AND ADDRESSES OF OWNERS OF Al See attached list marked as an exhibit.	BUTTING PROPERTIES ARE:
STATE OF NEW YORK	in Joy.
COUNTY OF ERIE	omississippi st, she 400
DI IC -	ng Address  But ffulo, NY 14203  g the ground and gave that the is the patitioner in this
action; that _he has read the foregoing Reque knowledge of deponent.	g duly sworn, deposed and says that _he is the petitioner in this est and knows the contents thereof; that the same is true to the
Sworn to before me this 29 day of April , 2016	
Basil 833	
NOTARY PUBLIC	



### Town of Aurora

300 Gleed Avenue East Aurora NY 14052



Zoning Board of Appeals Petitioner's Letter of Intent ardea Heath Applicants Name 76 Mississipp: St, Ste 460, Buffalo, NY 716-714-5699 Address of appeal **Zoning District** Zoning Code Section Type of Appeal: () A PERMIT FOR USE () A CERTIFICATE OF EXISTING USE () A VARIANCE FROM ZONING ORDINANCE () A PERMIT FOR OCCUPANCY () A TEMPORARY PERMIT OR EXTENSION THEREOF GROUNDS FOR VARIANCE: (may continue on separate sheet) see attacked ACKNOWLEDGMENT: Pursuant to Section 809 of the New York State General Municipal Law, the appellant shall state in his written appeal that to the best of his knowledge, no state officer or officer or employee of the Town of Aurora, has any interest in the appellant as defined in Section 809 of the General Municipal Law. If this statement cannot be made, the nature of any such interest must be disclosed as required by said State Law

#### **AUTHORIZATION**

As the contract vendee and Petitioner / Applicant regarding real property located at 1196 East Main Street, Town of Aurora, NY, we hereby authorize the Project Attorneys, Hopkins Sorgi & Romanowski PLLC to file a challenge to a code interpretation on our behalf and execute any required documentation, of the aforementioned property with the Town of Aurora along with applications for any other approvals/permits required from the Town of Aurora and other governmental agencies in connection with the proposed development at said real property.

Jennifer Jennings, Individually and as Principal of Cardea Health

Dated: April 29, 2016



March 29, 2016

Zoning Board of Appeals Town of Aurora 300 Gleed Avenue East Aurora, New York 14052

Re: Request for Zoning Code Interpretation

Property: 1196 East Main Street, Town of Aurora, NY

Applicant: Dr. Jennifer Jennings

Dear Zoning Board of Appeals:

Our firm represents Dr. Jennifer Jennings of Cardea Health, who, as agent for a limited liability to be formed, has entered into a contract to purchase 1196 East Main Street in the Town of Aurora, New York (the "Property"). This letter shall detail the grounds upon which our client seeks reversal of the Code Interpretation of the Code Enforcement Officer.

Attached as Exhibit A is the Request for Code Interpretation and attached as Exhibit B is the Code Interpretation.

The proposed use and Applicant's interpretation are detailed at Exhibit A.

#### The Code Enforcement Officer's Interpretation Should be Reversed

This application is based upon the definition and interpretation of a sanitarium pursuant to the Town of Aurora Zoning Code.

The Property is zoned Agricultural. Pursuant to the Town's Table of District Regulations contained in the Town's Zoning Code, the proposed use is a sanitarium requiring approval from the Zoning Board of Appeals (see Section 8 of the Town's Table of District Regulations):

"When approved by the Board of Appeals: an auto court, camp, cemetery, correctional institution, dog kennel, farm equipment display and sales, fur farm, outdoor ("drive-in") theater, public stable riding academy, and sanitarium other than general hospital. Private Club or private recreation area or building, not serving the

HOPKINS SORGI & ROMANOWSKI PLLC Attorneys at Law general public and not having a chief activity which is customarily conducted for profit."

The Zoning Code does not define sanitarium. It is well established New York law that any ambiguity in the zoning code must be interpreted in favor of the applicant and against the property owner. This is especially true in instances where the zoning code does not define the term subject to interpretation. To wit, New York Courts have held:

"It is well established that zoning codes, being in derogation of the common law, must be strictly construed against the enacting municipality" and "in favor of the owner of the subject property" so as to not place any greater interference on the free use of land than is absolutely necessary. (*Matter of Tartan Oil Corp. v Bohrer*, 249 AD2d 481, 482 (N.Y. App. Div. 2d Dep't 1998)); Matter of Falco Realty, Inc. v. Town of Poughkeepsie Zoning Bd. of Appeals, 40 A.D.3d 635, 636 (N.Y. App. Div. 2d Dep't 2007).

"Zoning codes and ordinances must be construed according to the words used in their ordinary meaning." <u>Matter of Falco Realty, Inc. v. Town of Poughkeepsie Zoning Bd. of Appeals, 40 A.D.3d 635, 636 (N.Y. App. Div. 2d Dep't 2007).</u>

Most importantly, when there is no definition in the zoning code, the law is as follows:

"Because the term ... was not defined, any ambiguity with regard to its meaning must be construed against the Village." <u>E & B</u>

<u>Realty, Inc. v. Zoning Bd. of Appeals, 275 A.D.2d 779, 780 (N.Y. App. Div. 2d Dep't 2000).</u>

The Code Enforcement Officer's Interpretation did not consider these well established standards of review which require great deference to the applicant. While the Code Enforcement Officer did recite definitions which he believes indicates that the proposed use is not a sanitarium, the applicant provided definitions which showed that the propose use is a sanitarium. In these instances, any ambiguity is required to be interpreted in favor of the municipality.

Sincerely,

HOPKINS SORGI & ROMANOWSKI PLLC

Petr J. Sorgi, Esq.

Enc.

cc: Dr. Jennifer Jennings

Aurora Town Clerk

Aurora Code Enforcement Officer

# **EXHIBIT A**



March 7, 2016

William Kramer Code Enforcement Officer Town of Aurora 300 Gleed Avenue East Aurora, New York 14052

Re: Request for Zoning Code Interpretation

Property: 1196 East Main Street, Town of Aurora, NY

Applicant: Dr. Jennifer Jennings

Dear Mr. Kramer:

Our firm represents Dr. Jennifer Jennings, who, as agent for a limited liability to be formed, has entered into a contract to purchase 1196 East Main Street in the Town of Aurora, New York (the "Property"). This letter shall explain Dr. Jennings' proposed use of the Property and formally request a code interpretation.

#### **Proposed Use**

Dr. Jennings proposes to use the Property for her personal residence and to operate Cardea Health, which is a business Dr. Jennings owns in Cheektowaga and Dunkirk.

Cardea Health Integrative is a woman-owned progressive integrative medical practice with a 30-year history of care that focuses on the whole patient. Following a comprehensive history and exam, practitioners utilize diverse healing tools customized to each patient and may include hyperbarics, far infrared sauna, nutritive support, mineral pool, massage, acupuncture and more. This innovative medical model is similar to holistic models instituted at Cleveland Clinic, Duke and University at Kansas Medical Center. More information regarding Cardea Health can be found on the company's website at http://cardeahealthwny.com and at Exhibit A.

Consistent with Cardea Health's mission, one of the goals in selecting 1196 East Main Street is have a location that integrates the natural aesthetics of the Property with the treatment in a tranquil setting. Accordingly, 1196 East Main Street is an ideal location.

#### 1196 East Main Street

The Property consists of 83.22± acres and has a very large main house consisting of 5,300± square feet, a second house and a barn. Cardea Health's operations and Dr. Jennings' residence would be located in the main house. The second house and barn are not proposed to be used as part of Cardea Health's operations. A copy of the survey of the Property is attached as Exhibit B.

Of the 83.22± acres, 65.72± acres are permanently preserved open space subject to a recorded Conservation Easement, a copy of which is attached as Exhibit C. The Conservation Easement, along with the location of nearby properties, shown at Exhibit D, clearly show that there exists substantial buffering of the portion of the Property to be utilized from nearby residential uses.

#### Zoning

The Property is zoned Agricultural, as shown of the Town Zoning Map attached as Exhibit E. Pursuant to the Town's Table of District Regulations contained in the Town's Zoning Code, a copy of which is attached as Exhibit F, the proposed use is a sanitarium requiring approval from the Zoning Board of Appeals (see Section 8 of the Town's Table of District Regulations:

"When approved by the Board of Appeals: an auto court, camp, cemetery, correctional institution, dog kennel, farm equipment display and sales, fur farm, outdoor ("drive-in") theater, public stable riding academy, and sanitarium other than general hospital. Private Club or private recreation area or building, not serving the general public and not having a chief activity which is customarily conducted for profit."

The Zoning Code does not define sanitarium, but this term it is defined by dictionary.com as "an institution for the preservation or recovery of health, especially for convalescence; health resort". A copy of the definition is provided at Exhibit G.<sup>1</sup>

The only improvement planned on the property would be the widening of the existing driveway entrance. No additional parking is planned at this time, as the property provides ample parking.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The term sanatorium is defined similarly in other dictionaries. For example, Webster's Dictionary defines sanatorium as follows: "an establishment that provides therapy combined with a regimen (as of diet and exercise) for treatment or rehabilitation".

Accordingly, it is requested that a code interpretation be issued stating that the only approval required by the Town of Aurora is approval by the Zoning Board of Appeals so we can prepare and submit the application to the Zoning Board of Appeals. Please contact me with any questions or if additional information is required. Thank you.

Sincerely,

HOPKINS SORGI & ROMANOWSKI PLLC

Peter J. Sorgi, Esq.

Enc.

cc: Town of Aurora Town Board Martha Librock, Town Clerk Dr. Jennifer Jennings

Anthony DiFilippo IV, Esq., Attorney for Purchaser in Real Estate Transaction Jeffrey Markello, Esq., Attorney for Seller in Real Estate Transaction David and Michele Socha, Property Owner Amy Mayfield, Realtor for Purchaser in Real Estate Transaction Dawn LoPresto, Realtor for Seller in Real Estate Transaction

## **EXHIBIT B**

SUPERVISOR James J. Bach (716) 652-7590 jbach@townofaurora.com



TOWN CLERK
Martha L. Librock
(716) 652-3280
townclerk@townofaurora.com

3/07/2016

#### **TOWN OF AURORA**

Southside Municipal Center
300 Gleed Avenue, East Aurora, NY 14052
www.townofaurora.com

TOWN COUNCIL MEMBERS Susan A, Friess sfriess@townofaurora.com

Jeffrey T. Harris jharris@townofaurora.com

Jolene M. Jeffe jjeffe@townofaurora.com

Charles D. Snyder csnyder@townofaurora.com

SUPT. OF HIGHWAYS David M. Gunner (716) 652-4050 highway@townofaurora.com

SUPT. OF BUILDING Patrick J. Blizniak (716) 652-7591 building@townofaurora.com

ASSESSOR Richard L. Dean assessor(ä4ownofautora.com (716) 652-0011

> DIR, OF RECREATION Christopher Musshafen (716) 652-8866 chris@townofaurora.com

> > TOWN ATTORNEY Ronald P. Bennett

TOWN JUSTICE Jeffrey P. Markello Anthony DiFilippo IV

HISTORIAN Robert L. Goller (716) 652-7944 historian@townofautoria.com

> FAX: (716) 652-3507 NYS Relay Number: 1(800) 662-1220

This institution is an equal opportunity provider and employer.

Peter Sorgi Hopkins Sorgi & Romanowski PLLC 26 Mississippi St, Suite 400

Buffalo, New York 14203

Re: Code Interpretation for proposed use at 1196 East Main St. East Aurora, NY.

Mr. Sorgi,

I have reviewed the information you have provided regarding the proposed use of the property at 1196 East Main St. I have also reviewed the Cardea Health website to gain further insight into the proposed business. While I realize there are diverse and innovative practices used in the healing processes advanced by this business I fail to see a clear separation between this health care facility and any other medical professional. Certainly the goal of any medical professional is "the preservation or recovery of health" as per the definition provided by dictionary.com. The completion of that same definition "especially for convalescence; health resort" would indicate something more than a facility where a patient goes for a weekly, monthly, annual or emergency medical appointment.

The thesaurus defines a sanitarium as "a hospital for recuperation or for the treatment of chronic diseases", and brings to mind the terms "convalescence home" or "nursing home". The Macmillan Dictionary considers the term "sanitarium" and "sanatorium" as synonymous and defines them as "a large building like a hospital where people who have had a serious illness go so that doctors can take care of them while they get better". These definitions further lend to my belief that the term sanitarium as used in the Town Code is referring to a long term rehabilitation clinic for patients requiring constant care and monitoring.

It is my determination, given the information provided, that Cardea Health would not be considered a sanitarium, and would not be an allowable use at 1196 East Main St. Cardea Health may be considered a professional office, but would only be permitted at this location if it met the criteria as laid out for Customary Accessory Uses included in the Permitted Uses of R1 District on the Town of

Aurora Table of District Regulations. The criteria include a professional office located and conducted wholly within the dwelling and incidental to the primary residential use of such dwelling, and allows for one employee as assistant to the resident professional. If you have any further questions regarding this determination, contact me at 652-7591.

Petitioner:

Sorgi, Hopkins & Romanowski PLLC aaf Jennifer Jennings (purchaser)

1196 Big Tree Rd East Aurora, NY 14052

SBL#:

165.00-1-28.21

**Abutting Properties:** 

Mailing Address (if different)

**Dept of Transportation** 

c/o Ed Rutkowski

State Rt 400

100 Seneca St

Buffalo, NY 14203-2939

SBL: 165.00-1-1

Alexandra McGeary & David Lawrence

856 Porterville Rd East Aurora, NY 14052

SBL: 165.00-1-8.1 Nicholas Trbovich

960 Porterville Rd Attn: Servotronics Inc

PO Box 300 Elma, NY 14059

SBL: 176.00-2-1

Townson Family, LLC-C2

28 Cook Rd

East Aurora, NY 14052

1153 East Main St

SBL: 165.00-1-29

Marcia Hoffman L/E (et al)

Attn: David Hoffman

1118 Big Tree Rd 1118 East Main St

East Aurora, NY 14052

SBL: 176.00-1-3.1 Martha Townson

1153 Big Tree Rd 1153 East Main St

East Aurora, NY 14052

SBL: 165.00-1-28.1 Michele Socha

V/L Big Tree Rd Attn: Beverly Hills Teddy Bear Co

24625 Railroad Ave Santa Clarita, CA 91321

SBL: 165.00-1-27.1

Patrice Quinn & John Mozrall

81 Billington Hts

East Aurora, NY 14052

DAVIN SOCHA 24077 CROSS ST. NEWHALL CA 9132

> MICHELE SOCHA 24625 RAILROAD AVE SANTACLANTIA, CA

9134

SBL: 176.00-2-2 Peter King 1227 Big Tree Rd East Aurora, NY 14052

SBL: 165.00-1-26 Michael & Julia Garvey 1250 Big Tree Rd

1250 East Main St East Aurora, NY 14052

SBL: 165.00-1-27.2 SBL: 165.00-1-25.11 Matthew Garvey V/L Big Tree

70 Balcom Dr

East Aurora, NY 14052

Socha Trust

Michele L. Socha Trustee

David W. Socha Trustee

David W. Socha Trustee

Sagi Hopkins & Roman owskin Plic, asagust Jennifer Jenning applicant/purchaser

196 By Tree Rd

SBL. 165.00-1-28.21

